

Ironwood Forest National Monument
Draft Goals and Objectives on Cultural Resources
June 9, 2004
Comment Summary

The following are summarized comments from the public meeting conducted Wednesday, June 9, 2004 at the Pima County Parks and Recreation Center in Tucson, Arizona. Larry Shults, Bureau of Land Management (BLM) Tucson Field Office, provided brief explanation of the previous meeting, which followed with a presentation on cultural resources by Max Witkind, Archaeologist, BLM Tucson Field Office. The conclusion of the presentation included an overview of draft goals for cultural resources that would be discussed in break-out groups.

Attendees worked in one discussion group and discussed the draft goals and objectives following the presentation.

General Comments

- BLM might want to include as a goal or objective to acquire land in the Los Robles (Archaeological) District for cultural resource protection.
- Advocates for cultural resources cannot protect them unless they know where the resources are located. Forming a group of “site stewards” should be an objective.
- There should be an objective to identify what sites should be available for interpretation.
- There should be a goal or objective to provide signs for the sites and to provide increased law enforcement.
- There should be small signs very close to cultural sites that would not draw attention to, nor detract attention from, the resource.

Specific Comments on the Draft Goals and Objectives for Cultural Resources

GOAL NUMBER 1: *Continue ongoing inventory and evaluation of cultural resources on the monument.*

- Condense to: Inventory and evaluate cultural resources on the monument.

Objective Number 1: *Complete 5,000-acre survey being conducted via a cooperative agreement with the University of Arizona.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 2: *Plan and conduct surveys in areas having potential significant resources that are at risk. The following are identified as high priority areas for survey:*

- *areas within 200 feet of roads and trails*
- *vicinity of Cocoraque Butte Archaeological District*
- *vicinity of Santa Ana del Cuiquiburitac Mission Site*

- Should priority of areas surveyed be decided in objectives or alternatives?
- More specifics on areas to survey should be included in the alternatives development portion of the planning process.
- A whole dataset is missing from the planning process if BLM does not consult elders of the tribes to complement their quantitative data with qualitative data.
- BLM should consult tribal elders to gather oral histories, consult with long-time residents and local historians, and take field trips with tribal elders.
- Once the University of Arizona study is complete, other sites/areas identified may be more of a priority than those identified in this objective.
- Delete the remainder of the objective after the first sentence, condensing Objective 2 to: Plan and conduct surveys in areas having potential significant resources that are at risk.
- Identify as priority areas those areas within proposed designated wilderness areas.

General Notes from Goal 1 Discussion:

- Create a new objective to consult the traditional and tribal leaders and collect qualitative data for the identification of resources.
- Add “significant cultural resources” to the glossary.
- There may be more than 7,000 archaeological sites.
- The class level of survey being conducted is higher than ever before, but still will not know everything on the monument.
- Protection and scientific study goals need to be developed simultaneously.
- To be a protected site an area need only be eligible to be listed on the NRHP, not actually listed on the NRHP.
- Preserving information from the site is not the same as preserving the site.

GOAL NUMBER 2: *Preserve and protect significant cultural resources and ensure that they are available for appropriate uses by present and future generations.*

- Leave Goal 2 as is except change “appropriate” to “allocated” uses and list allocated uses in the alternatives.
- Define “allocated uses” in the glossary.
- The statement needs to be stronger to contend with immediate threats.
- Is preserve and protect the correct terminology for all cultural resources?

Objective Number 1: *Protect and preserve in place representative examples of the full array of cultural resources on public lands for the benefit of scientific and public use by present and future generations.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 2: *Ensure that proposed land uses, initiated or authorized by BLM, avoid inadvertent damage to Federal and non-Federal cultural resources through reviews in compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 3: *Continue program of archaeological site monitoring and develop adaptive management response to identified threats.*

- Ok.

General Notes from Goal 2 Discussion:

- A law enforcement goal or objective needs to be included in the plan.
- A visitor center is not planned in the monument, but rather in a surrounding community.
- There should be a meeting/workshop devoted specifically to distinguishing interpretation and education goals and objectives for all resources, not just cultural.
- Prescott College would be interested in working on the education and interpretation elements of the plan.

GOAL NUMBER 3: *Recognize the potential public and scientific use of, and the values attributed to cultural resources on the public lands, and manage the lands and cultural resources so that these uses and values are not diminished, but rather are maintained and enhanced.*

- How are cultural resources enhanced? [Response by archaeologists: Cultural resource enhancement refers to protection or restoring of damage done by erosion or vandals, or, relocating trails to divert traffic away from resources for protection.]
- Would BLM really have the (financial) resources to enhance cultural resources?
- BLM should leave the option to enhance cultural resources open by including “enhance” in this goal.
- Could use “restored” instead of “enhanced.”
- “Wordsmith” this goal to make it easier to read.

Objective Number 1: *In accordance with BLM policy, allocate cultural resources to (1) scientific use, (2) conservation for future use, (3) traditional use, (4) public use, or (5) experimental use, or if lacking significant values, classify as discharged from management.*

- No specific comments were received on this objective.

Objective Number 2: *Provide educational and interpretive opportunities to enhance public understanding and appreciation of the cultural resources on the monument focusing on the themes of (1) prehistoric adaptations to the Sonoran Desert, (2) Tohono O’odham interactions with Euro-American settlers, and (3) historic mining and ranching.*

- Don’t limit themes to those listed here.
- Delete “themes.” Replace with “such as.”
- Add “and historical” after cultural.

- Objective 2 revised: Provide educational and interpretive opportunities to enhance public understanding and appreciation of the cultural and historical resources on the monument, such as (1) prehistoric adaptations to the Sonoran Desert, (2) Tohono O’odham interactions with Euro-American settlers, and (3) historic mining and ranching.
- Or, move specifics of the themes to the alternatives, rather than including within the objectives.

Objective Number 3: *Develop opportunities for the public to actively participate in volunteer programs that protect, preserve, conserve and interpret cultural resources on the monument.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 4: *Promote public interpretation of selected cultural resources in partnership with other organizations pursuing heritage tourism.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 5: *Promote archaeological research through partnerships and cooperative programs.*

- Ok.

GOAL NUMBER 4: *Contribute to land use planning and multiple use management of the public lands in ways that make optimal use of the thousands of years of land use history inherent in cultural resources information and that safeguard opportunities for attaining appropriate uses of cultural resources.*

- Eliminate “the thousands of years of land use history inherent in.”
- Change “appropriate” to “allocated.”
- Reword this goal to describe the BLM planning policy for cultural resources.

Objective Number 1: *Develop cultural resource management plans for (1) portions of Los Robles Archaeological District within IFNM, (2) Cocoraque Butte Archaeological District, and (3) Santa Ana del Cuiquiburitac Mission Site.*

- Move Objective 1 here to Goal 1.
- Move the list of specific resource management plans from objectives to alternatives.
- Do not limit consideration to these 3 sites until additional survey (by UofA) is completed.

Objective Number 2: *Participate in development of any plan amendments or implementation plans that have a potential to affect cultural resources.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 3: *Continue to participate in the Arizona State Office strategic planning for the cultural resource program on public lands.*

- Eliminate this objective.

Objective Number 4: *Coordinate with the agencies and tribes that manage cultural resources on adjacent lands.*

- Add “private landowners,” changing Objective 4 to: Coordinate with the agencies, private landowners and tribes that manage cultural resources on adjacent lands

General Notes from Goal 4 Discussion:

- BLM should explore the idea of purchasing buffer land to protect all resources on the monument. Create a goal specifically about purchasing of buffer property. (To be discussed at the July 28 Workshop).
- Use trails and trail enhancements as buffers to cultural resources.
- Maybe this entire goal is not necessary as it is inherent in BLM’s planning process.
- Objectives 2-4 could be included under Goal 3.
- Objective 1 is more of an action inherent in the planning process. Could eliminate.

GOAL NUMBER 5 – Caves: *Protect and manage caves in accordance with Federal Cave Resources Protection Act and BLM management guidelines. Protect significant cave resources including cultural, geological, biological, hydrological, educational, and recreational values and manage each cave for its primary unique resource opportunity.*

- Remove the first sentence of the goal.
- Do not limit caves to having a primary unique resource, a single cave may have multiple resources.
- Remove “primary.”
- Change Goal 5 to: Protect significant cave resources including cultural, geological, biological, hydrological, educational, and recreational values and manage each cave for its specific resources.

Objective Number 1: *Establish Memoranda of Understanding for Cooperative Agreements with appropriate scientific organizations, and other Federal and State agencies to allow for discovery and inventory of cave locations, and assessment of cave condition.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 2: *Establish criteria to assess the quality of the cave including cultural, geological, biological, hydrological, educational, and recreational values.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 3: *Conduct surveys where, based on geology, caves may occur. If cave is located, conduct assessment of quality of the cave.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 4: *Establish database for inventory of caves on the monument to include information to assess the quality of the cave. This may include locations that should remain confidential (adequate protection must be developed for these data entries) until a time, as determined by the BLM Director from advisement of resource staff that the cave has been evaluated and methods of protection from human entry established, if suitable.*

- Remove all but first sentence of the objective. Objective 4: Establish database for inventory of caves on the monument to include information to assess the quality of the cave.

General Notes from Goal 5 Discussion:

- A cave is a natural cavity or opening; mine shafts are not considered caves.

GOAL NUMBER 6 – Paleontology: *Protect and manage the paleontological resources for their scientific, educational, and recreational values in accordance with BLM management guidelines. Encourage the protection, storage, and preservation of fossils collected by qualified personnel from IFNM lands.*

- Remove all after “values” in the first sentence. Change Goal 6 to: Protect and manage the paleontological resources for their scientific, educational, and recreational values.

Objective Number 1: *Establish Memoranda of Understanding for Cooperative Agreements with a museum(s), university(ies), or other appropriate scientific organizations to allow for evaluation, collection, mitigation, curation, and protection of paleontological resources discovered on the monument and surrounding BLM lands.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 2: *Develop and maintain a database for known and discovered paleontological sites the monument and BLM administered lands.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 3: *Encourage paleontological surveys of areas that may have paleontological resources as part of the Memoranda of Understanding and cooperative agreement(s) with the restriction of fossil collection on the IFNM to qualified personnel, with fossils remaining in federal ownership in perpetuity.*

- Ok.

Objective Number 4: *Consider paleontological resources survey of areas on the monument subject to ground disturbance.*

- Define levels of disturbance in alternatives.